US ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS TRIBAL CONSULTATION POLICY AND RELATED DOCUMENTS

CONTENTS

USACE Tribal Consultation Policy, 1 Nov 2012

USACE Tribal Policy Principles, 10 May 2010

Department of the Army American Indian and Alaska Native Policy, 24 Oct 2012

Department of Defense American Indian and Alaska Native Policy, 20 Oct 1998

Tribal Consultation, Presidential Memorandum, 5 Nov 2009

Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments, Executive Order 13175, 6 Nov 2000



DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY U.S. ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS 441 G STREET, NW WASHINGTON, DC 20314-1000

NOV 1 2012

CECG

MEMORANDUM FOR Commanders, Directors and Chiefs of Separate Offices, US Army Corps of Engineers

SUBJECT: Tribal Consultation Policy

- 1. This memorandum affirms and formalizes current tribal consultation procedures for the U. S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE).
- 2. The interaction between the federal government and federally recognized Indian Tribes (including Alaska Natives) has its origins in the U. S. Constitution and has been upheld and defined through Treaties, U.S. Supreme Court cases, various statutes and regulations, presidential documents and policies, including the Department of Defense American Indian and Alaska Native Policy, and the USACE Tribal Policy Principles, recently reissued on 10 May 2010.
- 3. The Policy provides an outline of our responsibilities to federally recognized Tribes as well as a framework for consulting with them. It is purposefully general in nature because each of the 565 federally recognized American Indian and Alaska Native Tribes are distinct and separate governments, requiring a consultation process that may be completely unique to them.
- 4. USACE recognizes the sovereign status of Tribal governments and our obligation for pre-decisional government-to-government consultation. USACE also recognizes the unique role Tribes play as partners in water resources projects and seeks to develop relationships with all Tribes who may need our assistance in their capacity building and self-determination.
- 5. USACE has an excellent tribal program coordinated by a tribal liaison at Headquarters and a point of contact or liaison in each District and Division office. These experts are ready to support you and answer any questions you have regarding tribal policies.
- 6. An accountable process to interact with Tribes is mandated in Executive Order 13175, Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments, 06 Nov 2000, and Presidential Memorandum, Tribal Consultation, 05 Nov 2009. Please ensure that your staff is aware of and abides by our Consultation Policy to ensure effective and mutually beneficial relationships with tribal partners.
- 7. My point of contact on this issue is Dr. Georgeie Reynolds, (202) 761-5855.

Encl

THOMAS P. BOSTICK Lieutenant General, U. S. Army

Commanding

U.S. Army Corps of Engineers Tribal Consultation Policy

1. References.

- a. U.S. Constitution, Articles I, Section 8; Article VI.
- b. National Historic Preservation Act.
- c. American Indian Religious Freedom Act.
- d. Archaeological Resources Protection Act.
- e. Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act.
- f. Religious Freedom Restoration Act.
- g. Executive Order 13007, Indian Sacred Sites, 24 May 1996.
- h. Department of Defense American Indian and Alaska Native Policy, 20 Oct 1998.
 - i. Executive Order 13175, Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments, 06 Nov 2000.
 - j. Engineer Regulation 1105-2-100, *Planners Guidance Notebook*, 22 Apr 2000.
- k. Department of Defense Instruction Number 4710.02: DoD Interactions with Federally Recognized Tribes, 14 Sep 2006.
- 1. Army Regulation 200-1, *Environmental Protection and Enhancement*, 13 Dec 2007.
- m. Engineer Regulation 1130-2-540, *Project Operations Environmental Stewardship Operations and Maintenance Guidelines and Procedures*, 11 Aug 2008.
 - n. Presidential Memorandum, Tribal Consultation, 5 Nov 2009.
 - o. USACE *Tribal Policy Principles*, 18 Feb 1998 and 10 May 2010.
- p. Announcement of Presidential support for the *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples*, Public Papers of the President, December 16, 2010.
- 2. Purpose. On November 5, 2009, President Barack Obama issued a Memorandum to the heads of all federally agencies entitled *Tribal Consultation* (74 Fed Reg 57881) reaffirming Executive

Order 13175, Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments (65 Fed Reg 67249) signed by President William J. Clinton on November 6, 2000. E.O. 13175 requires all federal agencies to formulate "an accountable process to ensure meaningful and timely input by tribal officials in the development of regulatory policies that have tribal implications." This document affirms the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers' (USACE) commitment to engage in consultation with federally recognized Tribes.

3. Background. There are responsibilities to Tribes resulting from the Federal Trust Doctrine, as well as from Treaties, statutes, regulations, Executive Orders and agreements between the United States government and tribal governments. Department of Defense American Indian and Alaska Native Policy, Department of Defense Instruction number 4710.02: DoD Interactions with Federally Recognized Tribes, and US Army Corps of Engineers Tribal Policy Principles (Attachment 1) provide guidance.

For the purposes of this policy, the following definitions are applied:

- a. Tribe: Indian Tribes as defined in E.O. 13175, "an Indian or Alaska Native tribe, band, nation, pueblo, village, or community that the Secretary of the Interior acknowledges to exist as an Indian tribe pursuant to the Federally Recognized Indian Tribe List Act of 1994, 25 USC 479a."
- b. Consultation: Open, timely, meaningful, collaborative and effective deliberative communication process that emphasizes trust, respect and shared responsibility. To the extent practicable and permitted by law, consultation works toward mutual consensus and begins at the earliest planning stages, before decisions are made and actions are taken; an active and respectful dialogue concerning actions taken by the USACE that may significantly affect tribal resources, tribal rights (including treaty rights) or Indian lands.
- 4. Applicability. This regulation applies to all HQUSACE elements, Major Subordinate Commands, District Commands, the Institute for Water Resources, the Humphreys Engineering Center Support Activity, and the Engineer Research and Development Center.
- 5. General Policy. The Tribal Policy Principles.
- a. All federally recognized Tribes are sovereign governments and will be treated with respect.
 - (1) Sovereignty is the foundation of tribal governments.
 - (2) Tribes are responsible for their own governance and management.
 - b. The Trust responsibility will be honored and fulfilled.
- (1) The federal government has a unique legal and political relationship with Tribal governments that recognizes self-government and self-determination.

- (2) USACE is committed to supporting projects and programs beneficial to Tribes through partnership with them.
- (3) USACE will ensure that it addresses Tribal concerns regarding protected tribal resources, tribal rights (including treaty rights) and Indian lands.
- (4) USACE will protect and allow access to protected tribal resources under USACE jurisdiction to the extent practicable, and will work to develop and implement access policies as needed.
- (5) USACE will share information that is not otherwise controlled or classified information.
 - c. USACE will maintain a government-to-government relationship with Tribes.
- (1) Tribes have a unique and distinctive political and legal relationship with the United States.
- (2) A Tribe may have access to the Chief of Engineers, the Assistant Secretary of the Army (Civil Works), and other high level individuals if the need arises.
- (3) While most interaction will be staff to staff, decision making will be leader to leader (the head of the Tribe and the district commander), with the assistance of the local subject matter expert (typically, the Tribal Liaison).
- d. Consultation will be an integral, invaluable process of USACE planning and implementation.
- (1) When appropriate, potentially affected Tribes, as determined by the Corps, including Tribes whose aboriginal territories extend to the lands where an activity would occur, will be contacted by letter, telephone or e-mail sufficiently early to allow a timely review of the proposed action. If contacted Tribes notify USACE that other Tribes are potentially affected, USACE has the responsibility to notify those Tribes as well.
- (2) Any activity that has the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights (including treaty rights) and Indian lands-individual projects, programs, permit applications, real estate actions, promulgation of regulations and policies-regardless of land status, will be reviewed at the district level by an individual who effectively interacts with Tribes, usually the Tribal Liaison.
- (3) Consultation will be conducted at the district or division level under the guidance of an individual who effectively interacts with Tribes, usually the Tribal Liaison, unless there is a request for HQUSACE (and/or OASA(CW) in the case of Civil Works) input, or if HQUSACE determines input is necessary.

- (4) Commands will ensure that all Tribes with an interest in a particular activity that has the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights (including treaty rights) and Indian lands are contacted and their comments taken into consideration.
- (5) Consultation procedures for individual projects or programs may be developed at the local level to meet the needs of particular Tribe(s).
- (6) In recognition of the varied organizations and customs of different Tribes, written protocols for consultation procedures may be considered and implemented at the local level with a specific Tribe.
- (7) A dispute resolution process will be developed during the consultation process, including a provision to elevate the consultation to higher USACE and/or Tribal levels.
 - (8) Requests for consultation by a Tribe to USACE will be honored.
- e. USACE will support Tribal self-determination, self reliance and capacity building by:
- (1) Partnering with Tribes on studies, projects, programs and permitting procedures will be supported and promoted to the extent permitted by law and policy.
- (2) To the extent permitted by law and policy, provide information on opportunities to compete for requests for proposals or other potential contracts with USACE.
- (3) Sharing appropriate information on USACE programs, policies and procedures, and public documents.
 - (4) Utilizing Tribal knowledge for planning purposes and to inform operational activities.
- (5) Supporting Tribal efforts to lease and operate water resource projects and lands, where appropriate.
- (6) Identifying and implementing, within existing authority, other capacity-building opportunities as they occur.
 - f. Protection of natural and cultural resources.
- (1) USACE recognizes the importance of strict compliance with the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA), the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) and other statutes concerning cultural and natural resources.
- (2) USACE acknowledges that compliance with the above statutes may not comprise the full range of consultation, nor of cultural property and resource protection.

- (3) To the extent allowed by law, USACE will protect the location of historic properties, properties of religious and cultural significance, and archaeological resources, in consultation with and when requested by the affected Tribe(s).¹
- 6. Responsibilities of Commanders and other USACE officials interacting with federally recognized Tribes.
- a. Build relationships with Tribes soon after each change of command by face-to-face interaction at the local headquarters or at tribal offices when at all possible.
 - b. Identify and remove procedural impediments to working with Tribes whenever possible.
- c. Share appropriate Corps procedures, regulations and organizational information with Tribes.
- d. Maintain open lines of communication through consultation with Tribes during the decision making process for those matters that have the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights (including treaty rights) and Indian lands.
 - e. Provide Tribes with points of contact on project-related issues, and issues in general.
 - f. Encourage partnerships on projects with Tribes wherever possible.
- g. Encourage collaborative partnerships by other federal and state agencies with Tribes to further their goals and projects.
- 7. Education. To develop a proactive well-informed workforce, in-house training, workshops, and an annual meeting of USACE tribal liaisons have been developed and should be attended by Corps employees who interact with Tribes-liaisons, project managers, program managers, real estate professionals, regulators, leaders, contracting specialists, etc.
- 8. Accountability. To assess the effectiveness of USACE Tribal consultation, professionals who interact with Tribes will keep records of consultation meetings and other tribal interactions. These records will be accessible and can be made available for purposes of reporting to OMB through DoD as per the reporting requirement in the Presidential Proclamation of 5 Nov 2009. The report will be synthesized at HQUSACE and transmitted to DoD (OSD) on a yearly basis. A copy of this report will be distributed to federally recognized Tribes upon request.
- 9. Implementation. USACE will incorporate the six Tribal policy principles, including predecisional consultation, into its planning, management, budgetary, operational, and legislative

¹ USACE will make every reasonable effort, consistent with law, to withhold this information. However, USACE is required to provide public access to its records under the Freedom of Information Act and can only withhold those records protected from disclosure under a statutory exemption or exclusion. Tribes are encouraged to seek legal advice before providing sensitive information to USACE.

initiatives, management accountability system and ongoing policy and regulation development processes.

10. General Provision: This policy does not establish new requirements, but reaffirms procedures and policies already in place, clarifies responsibilities and establishes clear measures of implementation success.²

² This policy is not intended to, and does not grant, expand, create, or diminish any legally enforceable rights, benefits, or trust responsibilities, substantive or procedural, not otherwise granted or created under existing law. Nor shall this policy be construed to alter, repeal, interpret, or modify tribal sovereignty, any treaty rights, or other rights of any Indian Tribe, or to preempt, modify or limit the exercise of any such right.

DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY

U.S. ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS WASHINGTON, D.C. 20314-1000

CECW 1 0 MAY 2010

MEMORANDUM FOR COMMANDERS, DIRECTORS, AND CHIEFS OF SEPARATE OFFICES, HQ USACE

SUBJECT: Sovereignty and Government-to-Government Relations with American Indian and Alaska Native Tribal Governments: USACE Tribal Policy Principles

- 1. This memorandum affirms the continuing applicability of the six USACE Tribal Policy Principles, issued by the Chief of Engineers on 18 Feb 1998, and embodied in Executive Order 13175, *Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments*, 06 Nov 2000, and in President Obama's Presidential Memorandum of 05 Nov 2009.
- 2. The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers continues to recognize the sovereign status of American Indian and Alaska Native Tribal Governments, and our obligation for consultation on a government-to-government basis. We remain committed to fulfilling our Nation's trust responsibility to Tribes in accordance with the Constitution, Treaties, executive orders, statutes, and the Supreme Court decisions that gave rise to and define that responsibility.
- 3. The Corps also recognizes the central role of Tribes in protecting and managing their own resources, and remains committed to working in partnership with Tribes on projects that build Tribal capacity and foster development.
- 4. To facilitate the implementation of our Tribal Policy Principles, the Corps has created a Tribal Nations Program and Community of Practice under the direction of a Tribal Liaison at Headquarters, with a Tribal Point of Contact in each Corps District and Division office.
- 5. Fulfilling the Tribal trust responsibility is required by law. Please ensure that your staff is aware of and abides by our Tribal Policy to ensure effective and mutually beneficial relationships with our Tribal partners. It is good for the Nation, the Tribes and the Corps.

6. My point of contact on this issue is Dr. Georgeie Reynolds, (202) 761-5855.

Encl

R. L. VAN ANTWERP Lieutenant General, US Army

Commanding

U.S. ARMY CORPS OF ENGINEERS TRIBAL POLICY PRINCIPLES

TRIBAL SOVEREIGNTY -The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers recognizes that Tribal governments are sovereign entities, with rights to set their own priorities, develop and manage Tribal and trust resources, and be involved in Federal decisions or activities which have the potential to affect these rights. Tribes retain inherent powers of self-government.

TRUST RESPONSIBILITY - The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers will work to meet trust obligations, protect trust resources, and obtain Tribal views of trust and treaty responsibilities or actions related to the Corps, in accordance with provisions of treaties, laws and Executive Orders as well as principles lodged in the Constitution of the United States.

GOVERNMENT-TO-GOVERNMENT RELATIONS - The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers will ensure that Tribal Chairs/Leaders meet with Corps Commanders/Leaders and recognize that, as governments, Tribes have the right to be treated with appropriate respect and dignity, in accordance with principles of self-determination.

PRE-DECISIONAL AND HONEST CONSULTATION - The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers will reach out, through designated points of contact, to involve Tribes in collaborative processes designed to ensure information exchange, consideration of disparate viewpoints before and during decision making, and utilize fair and impartial dispute resolution mechanisms.

SELF RELIANCE, CAPACITY BUILDING, AND GROWTH - The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers will search for ways to involve Tribes in programs, projects and other activities that build economic capacity and foster abilities to manage Tribal resources while preserving cultural identities.

NATURAL AND CULTURAL RESOURCES - The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers will act to fulfill obligations to preserve and protect trust resources, comply with the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, and ensure reasonable access to sacred sites in accordance with published and easily accessible guidance.

DE STATE OF THE ST

SECRETARY OF THE ARMY WASHINGTON

2 4 OCT 2012

MEMORANDUM FOR Principal Official of Headquarters, Department of the Army

SUBJECT: American Indian and Alaska Native Policy

1. References:

- a. Department of Defense American Indian and Alaska Native Policy, 20 October 1998.
- b. Department of Defense Instruction 4710.02, DoD Interactions with Federally Recognized Tribes, 14 September 2006.
- 2. Purpose. This memorandum establishes Department of the Army policy for interaction with Federally-recognized American Indian and Alaska Native Tribes (Federally-recognized Tribes), in accordance with references 1.a. and 1.b.
- 3. Policy. The Department of the Army will:
- a. Meet its responsibilities to Federally-recognized Tribes as derived from the federal trust doctrine, treaties, and agreements and comply with federal statutes and regulations, presidential memoranda and executive orders governing interactions with Federally-recognized Tribes.
- b. Build stable and enduring government-to-government relations with Federally-recognized Tribes in a manner that sustains the Army mission and minimizes effects on protected tribal resources. The Army will communicate with Federally-recognized Tribes on a government-to-government basis in recognition of their sovereignty.
- c. Recognize, respect and take into consideration the significance that Federallyrecognized Tribes ascribe to protected tribal resources when undertaking Army mission activities and when managing Army lands.
- d. Fully integrate the principles of meaningful consultation and communication with Federally-recognized Tribes at all organizational levels including staff officers and civilian officials. The Army will consider the unique qualities of individual Federally-recognized Tribes when applying these principles.
- 4. This policy recognizes the importance of understanding and addressing the concerns of Federally-recognized Tribes prior to reaching decisions on matters that may have the potential to significantly affect tribal rights, tribal lands or protected tribal resources.

SUBJECT: American Indian and Alaska Native Policy

5. Definition of Key Terms:

- a. Tribal rights: Those rights legally accruing to a Federally-recognized Tribe or tribes by virtue of inherent sovereign authority, unextinguished aboriginal title, treaties, statutes, judicial decisions, executive orders or agreement and that give rise to legally enforceable remedies.
- b. Tribal lands: Any lands title to which is: either held in trust by the United States for the benefit of any Federally-recognized Indian tribe or individual or held by any Federally-recognized Indian tribe or individual subject to restrictions by the United States against alienation.
- c. Protected tribal resources: Those natural resources and properties of traditional or customary religious or cultural importance, either on or off Tribal lands, retained by, or reserved by or for, Federally-recognized Tribes through treaties, statutes, judicial decisions or executive orders.
- 6. This policy is not intended to, and does not grant, expand, create or diminish any legally enforceable rights, benefits or trust responsibilities, substantive or procedural not otherwise granted or created under existing law. This policy shall not be construed to alter, amend, repeal, interpret or modify tribal sovereignty, any treaty rights or other rights of any Indian tribes or to preempt, modify or limit the exercise of any such right.

John M. McHugh

PREAMBLE

These principles establish the Department of Defense's (DoD) American Indian and Alaska Native Policy for interacting and working with federally-recognized American Indian and Alaska Native governments (hereinafter referred to as "tribes"¹)(a). These principles are based on tribal input, federal policy, treaties, and federal statutes. The DoD policy supports tribal self-governance and government-to-government relations between the federal government and tribes. Although these principles are intended to provide general guidance to DoD Components on issues affecting tribes² (b), DoD personnel must consider the unique qualities of individual tribes when applying these principles, particularly at the installation level. These principles recognize the importance of increasing understanding and addressing tribal concerns, past, present, and future. These concerns should be addressed prior to reaching decisions on matters that may have the potential to significantly affect (c&d) protected tribal resources, tribal rights, or Indian lands³ (e).

- Protected Tribal Resources: Those natural resources and properties of traditional or customary religious or cultural importance, either on or off Indian lands, retained by, or reserved by or for, Indian tribes through treaties, statutes, judicial decisions, or executive orders, including tribal trust resources.
- Tribal Rights: Those rights legally accruing to a tribe or tribes by virtue of inherent sovereign authority, unextinguished
 aboriginal title, treaty, statute, judicial decisions, executive order or agreement, and that give rise to legally enforceable
 remedies.
- Indian Lands (f): Any lands title to which is either: 1) held in trust by the United States for the benefit of any Indian tribe or individual; or 2) held by any Indian tribe or individual subject to restrictions by the United States against alienation.

(a) This policy governs Department interactions with federally recognized tribes only; it does not govern interaction with unrecognized tribes, state-recognized tribes, Alaska Native corporations, or Native Hawaiian Organizations. [In Alaska, as a practical matter, the Department may be required to consult with Alaska Native corporations simply because these corporate entities own and manage much of the land in Alaska. In addition, all Federal agencies must consult with Alaska Native corporations "on the same basis as Indian tribes under Executive Order No. 13175." See section 161 of Public Law 108-199 (188 Stat. 452), as amended by section 518 of Public Law 108-447 (118 Stat. 3267)]. DoD interactions with Native Hawaiian Organizations are governed by Department of Defense Instruction 4710.03, "Consultation With Native Hawaiian Organizations," issued on October 25, 2011. A copy of the Instruction is available at www.denix.osd.mil/na/hawaii.

- (b) This policy neither enlarges nor diminishes the Department's legal obligations with respect to federally recognized tribes, nor does the policy provide an independent cause of action upon which the Department may be sued.
- (c) The phrase "may have the potential to significantly affect," which appears throughout the policy, establishes the general threshold or "trigger" for consultation to be used unless a statute or other legal obligation specifically establishes a lower threshold for consultation. It is expected that DoD personnel will informally contact interested tribes whenever there is any real possibility that tribal interests may be affected by proposed DoD actions, but that continued, more formal consultation will be necessary only when it appears, from initial discussions with a tribe, that tribal interests will be significantly affected by the proposed action. In other words, the policy anticipates a two-step process designed first, to overcome the fact that, as non-Indians, we may not always recognize the effect our actions may have on tribal interests unless we ask; and second, to permit DoD to proceed without the need for further consultation unless potentially significant consequences are identified during this initial discussion. [Note: The word "significantly" is used in this policy in its ordinary dictionary sense; i.e., as a synonym for

¹ As defined by most current Department of Interior/Bureau of Indian Affairs list of tribal entities published in Federal Register pursuant to Section 104 of the Federally Recognized Indian Tribe List Act.

² This policy is not intended to, and does not, grant, expand, create, or diminish any legally enforceable rights, benefits, or trust responsibilities, substantive or procedural, not otherwise granted or created under existing law. Nor shall this policy be construed to alter, amend, repeal, interpret, or modify tribal sovereignty, any treaty rights, or other rights of any Indian tribes, or to preempt, modify, or limit the exercise of any such rights.

³ Definition of Key Terms:

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE

"material" or "important." It should not be interpreted in the NEPA or Council on Environmental Quality NEPA Regulations sense, as that would set a higher threshold for consultation than is intended.]

- (d) There is no obligation to consult with tribes absent a proposal that "may have the potential to significantly affect" tribal interests. In other words, the obligation to consult with tribes under this policy is event- or proposal-driven. Nonetheless, as a matter of discretion, general consultation may be desirable where an installation expects to have frequent interaction with a tribe and wishes to establish a stand-by protocol for consultation absent the pressures associated with a particular proposal.
- (e) The phrase "protected tribal resources, tribal rights, or Indian lands," which appears throughout the policy, works in conjunction with the "may have the potential to significantly affect" trigger to determine when DoD must consult with tribes. Generally speaking, DoD must consult with tribes only when its proposed actions may have the potential to significantly affect Indian lands, treaty rights, or other tribal interests protected by statute, regulation, or executive order. [Note: Some statutes may establish a lower threshold for consultation than the default threshold established in this policy (see, e.g., 16 U.S.C. 470a(d)(6)(B)); in such cases, the Department must consult with tribes in accordance with the statutory requirements.] [Note also, that individual rural residents of Alaska, including both Natives and non-Natives, generally have a right to engage in nonwasteful subsistence uses of fish, wildlife, and other wild, renewable resources on public lands in Alaska. While this right is not a tribal right per se, installations nonetheless may find it both convenient and beneficial to consult with the appropriate Alaska Native entity whenever a proposed DoD action may have the potential to adversely affect the subsistence activities of several members of the same village or tribe.]
- (f) With respect to Alaska, the term "Indian Lands" does not include lands held by Alaska Native Corporations or lands conveyed in fee to an Indian Reorganization Act entity or traditional village council; the term may include village-owned townsite lands (depending on the particular status of the village itself and upon a fact-specific inquiry into whether the area at issue qualifies as a dependent Indian community), and individual Native townsite lots and Native allotments (so long as these properties remain in either restricted fee or trust allotment form).

I. TRUST RESPONSIBILITIES

DoD will meet its responsibilities to tribes. These responsibilities are derived from:

- Federal trust doctrine (g) (i.e., the trust obligation of the United States government to the tribes);
- Treaties, Executive Orders, Agreements, Statutes, and other obligations between the United States government and tribes, to include:
- 1. Federal statutes (e.g., Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, American Indian Religious Freedom Act, National Environmental Policy Act, National Historic Preservation Act, Alaska National Interest Lands Conservation Act, Alaskan Native Claims Settlement Act, and Archeological Resources Protection Act); and
- 2. Other federal policies (e.g., Executive Order 12898, "Environmental Justice"; Executive Order 13007, "Indian Sacred Sites"; Executive Order 13021 "Tribal Colleges and Universities"; "Executive Memorandum: Government to Government Relations with Native American Tribal Governments," dated 29 April 1994; and Executive Order 13084, "Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments").

DoD will annually review the status of relations with tribes to ensure that DoD is:

- Fulfilling its federal responsibilities; and
- Addressing tribal concerns related to protected tribal resources, tribal rights, or Indian lands.

(g) Under the federal trust doctrine, the United States--and individual agencies of the federal government--owe a fiduciary duty to Indian tribes. The nature of that duty depends on the underlying substantive laws (i.e., treaties, statutes, agreements) creating the duty. Where agency actions may affect Indian lands or off-reservation treaty rights, the trust duty includes a substantive duty to protect these lands and treaty rights "to the fullest extent possible." Otherwise, unless the law imposes a specific duty on the federal government with respect to Indians, the trust responsibility may be discharged by the agency's compliance with general statutes and regulations not specifically aimed at protecting Indian tribes.

II. GOVERNMENT TO GOVERNMENT RELATIONS

Build stable and enduring relationships with tribes by:

- Communicating with tribes on a government-to-government basis (h) in recognition of their sovereignty;
- Requiring meaningful communication addressing tribal concerns between tribes and military
 installations at both the tribal leadership-to-installation commander and the tribal staff-toinstallation staff levels (i);
- Establishing a senior level tribal liaison in the Office of the Secretary of Defense (j) and other appropriate points of contact within DoD to ensure that tribal inquiries are channeled to appropriate officials within DoD and responded to in a timely manner;
- Providing, to the extent permitted by DoD authorities and procedures, information concerning opportunities available to tribes to: 1) compete for contracts, subcontracts, and grants, and participate in cooperative agreements; 2) benefit from education and training; 3) obtain employment; and 4) obtain surplus equipment and property;
- Assessing, through consultation, the effect of proposed DoD actions that may have the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights, and Indian lands before decisions are made (k);
- Taking appropriate steps to remove any procedural or regulatory impediments to DoD working directly and effectively with tribes on activities that may have the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights, and Indian lands; and
- Working with other federal agencies, in consultation with tribes, to minimize duplicative requests (1) for information from tribes.
- (h) Indian tribes have been called "domestic dependent nations"--i.e., nations within a nation. As such, consultation with tribes on a "government-to-government basis" requires a high degree of formality. Unless--or until--a tribal-specific protocol for consultation has been developed, formal contact with a tribe should be made by the installation commander, and should be directed to the tribe's senior elected official, usually referred to as the tribal chair, governor, or president.
- (i) Although communication with tribes on a government-to-government basis demands attention--at least initially--at a relatively senior level of command, the goal should be to develop mutually acceptable protocols or procedures that will allow most day-to-day liaison and work with interested tribes to be accomplished on a staff-to-staff basis. Senior commanders and tribal leaders should be kept apprised of this day-to-day interaction, but--once these protocols are in place--need act personally and directly only when requested to do so by the other party.
- (j) Although the Deputy Under Secretary of Defense for Environmental Security will provide tribes with a senior-level liaison to ensure tribal inquires are promptly addressed, DoD officials at all levels of command should strive to make it easier for tribes to receive timely answers to the questions they may have concerning DoD activities that may affect them. One way to accomplish this at the installation level could be to designate and announce a principal point-of-contact for the receipt of tribal inquiries.
- (k) The single most important element of consultation is to initiate the dialogue with potentially affected tribes before decisions affecting tribal interests are made. Meaningful consultation demands that the information obtained from tribes be given particular, though not necessarily dispositive, consideration; this can happen only if tribal input is solicited early enough in the planning process that it may actually influence the decision to be made. Consultation is worth very little if decisions have already been made.
- (1) Keep in mind that many tribes have relatively few enrolled members and only a limited staff to respond to your requests. This being the case, coordinate your requests for information with other federal agencies whenever doing so may reduce the administrative burden on the affected tribe.

III. CONSULTATION

Fully integrate (down to staff officers at the installation level) the principle and practice of meaningful consultation and communication with tribes by:

- Recognizing that there exists a unique and distinctive political relationship between the United States and the tribes that mandates that, whenever DoD actions may have the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights, or Indian lands, DoD must provide affected tribes an opportunity to participate in the decision-making process that will ensure these tribal interests are given due consideration in a manner consistent with tribal sovereign authority (m);
- Consulting consistent with government-to-government relations and in accordance with protocols
 mutually agreed to (n) by the particular tribe and DoD, including necessary dispute resolution
 processes;
- Providing timely notice to, and consulting with, tribal governments prior to taking any actions
 that may have the potential to significantly affect protected tribal resources, tribal rights, or Indian
 lands;
- Consulting in good faith throughout the decision-making process (o); and
- Developing and maintaining effective communication, coordination, and cooperation with tribes, especially at the tribal leadership-to-installation commander level and the tribal staff-toinstallation staff levels.

(m) What constitutes "due consideration...consistent with tribal sovereignty" depends, in part, on the underlying law that dictates that consultation take place. "Consultation" can vary from simple notice of a pending action to negotiation to obtain the tribe's formal consent to a proposed action (the absence of which may be enough to stop that action from proceeding). The attached table summarizes the specific legal obligations owed tribes under the trust doctrine and various statutes. In general, two principles should be kept in mind. One, tribes are not just another interested party; where tribal interests may be significantly affected, tribes must be regarded as separate from the general public for the purposes of consultation. Second, in most cases, consultation should include an invitation to potentially affected tribes to provide information to DoD concerning actions that may significantly affect tribal interests; that information should be given special consideration. In some instances, e.g., where Indian lands or treaty rights may be significantly and adversely affected, tribal rights may take precedence and dictate that DoD protect these rights to the fullest extent possible.

- (n) The are over 570 federally recognized Indian tribes, each with its own distinctive cultural identity. Just as is true with foreign nations, a "one-size-fits-all" prescription for consultation with Indian tribes is neither appropriate nor possible. Instead, installations should expect to have to negotiate a mutually agreeable protocol with each separate tribe with which it must consult. While certain elements can be expected to be a part of any such protocol, installations should be mindful of the fact that tribes all have different ways of controlling property, harvesting natural resources, revering the environment, and even conducting consultations.
- (o) Keep it in mind that the consultation trigger contemplates a two-step process. Consultation need continue throughout the decision-making process only for those proposals that have the potential to significantly affect tribal interests.

IV. NATURAL AND CULTURAL RESOURCES PROTECTION

Recognize and respect the significance tribes ascribe to certain natural resources and properties of traditional or customary religious or cultural importance by:

- Undertaking DoD actions and managing DoD lands consistent with the conservation of protected tribal resources and in recognition of Indian treaty rights to fish, hunt, and gather resources at both on- and off-reservation locations (p);
- Enhancing, to the extent permitted by law, tribal capabilities to effectively protect and manage natural and cultural tribal trust resources (q) whenever DoD acts to carry out a program that may have the potential to significantly affect those tribal trust resources;
- Accommodating, to the extent practicable and consistent with military training, security, and readiness requirements, tribal member access to sacred and off-reservation treaty fishing, hunting, and gathering sites located on military installations; and
- Developing tribal specific protocols to protect (r), to the maximum extent practicable and consistent with the Freedom of Information Act, Privacy Act, National Historic Preservation Act, and Archeological Resources Protection Act, tribal information regarding protected tribal resources that has been disclosed to, or collected by, the DoD.

WILLIAM S. COHEN

SECRETARY OF DEFENSE

William J. P.

October 20, 1998

⁽p) Fulfillment of the trust responsibility demands that federal agencies protect the lands and habitats that support the resources upon which the meaningful exercise of tribal hunting, fishing, and gathering rights depend. This includes actions on non-Indianowned lands (including DoD installations) that may affect Indian lands or off-reservation treaty rights (such as reserved rights to hunt, fish, or gather on treaty-ceded lands or "usual and accustomed" grounds and stations). In addition, in Alaska, DoD must endeavor to protect the continued viability of all wild, renewable resources in order to minimize, to the extent possible, the adverse effects of its actions on rural residents who depend upon subsistence uses of such renewable resources.

⁽q) Where a proposed DoD action may have the potential to significantly affect tribal trust resources (i.e., Indian lands or treaty rights to certain resources) or DoD has been given express statutory authority (e.g., §8050 of the Department of Defense Appropriations Act of FY 1999), DoD may have limited authority to help develop and enhance the affected tribe's capacity to better manage these resources. This, however, is an area fraught with fiscal law pitfalls; consequently, installations are advised to consult with legal counsel before committing to expend appropriated funds for this purpose.

⁽r) Presently, legal authority to protect tribal information concerning sacred sites is very limited. Section 9 of the Archeological Resources Protection Act (16 U.S.C. § 470hh) and Section 304 of the National Historic Preservation Act (16 U.S.C. § 470w-3) may provide some protection from a request for such information, but may not be enough to guarantee confidentiality in the face of a Freedom of Information Act request for disclosure--especially the NHPA provision. A written consultation agreement with a tribe may be appropriate in some circumstances and permit an installation to withhold disclosure under FOIA Exemption 5, but even this tactic may prove to be ineffective. As a consequence, installations should be careful not to overstate their ability to keep sensitive tribal information confidential.

Federal Register

Vol. 74, No. 215

Monday, November 9, 2009

Presidential Documents

Title 3—

Memorandum of November 5, 2009

The President

Tribal Consultation

Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments And Agencies

The United States has a unique legal and political relationship with Indian tribal governments, established through and confirmed by the Constitution of the United States, treaties, statutes, executive orders, and judicial decisions. In recognition of that special relationship, pursuant to Executive Order 13175 of November 6, 2000, executive departments and agencies (agencies) are charged with engaging in regular and meaningful consultation and collaboration with tribal officials in the development of Federal policies that have tribal implications, and are responsible for strengthening the government-to-government relationship between the United States and Indian tribes.

History has shown that failure to include the voices of tribal officials in formulating policy affecting their communities has all too often led to undesirable and, at times, devastating and tragic results. By contrast, meaningful dialogue between Federal officials and tribal officials has greatly improved Federal policy toward Indian tribes. Consultation is a critical ingredient of a sound and productive Federal-tribal relationship.

My Administration is committed to regular and meaningful consultation and collaboration with tribal officials in policy decisions that have tribal implications including, as an initial step, through complete and consistent implementation of Executive Order 13175. Accordingly, I hereby direct each agency head to submit to the Director of the Office of Management and Budget (OMB), within 90 days after the date of this memorandum, a detailed plan of actions the agency will take to implement the policies and directives of Executive Order 13175. This plan shall be developed after consultation by the agency with Indian tribes and tribal officials as defined in Executive Order 13175. I also direct each agency head to submit to the Director of the OMB, within 270 days after the date of this memorandum, and annually thereafter, a progress report on the status of each action included in its plan together with any proposed updates to its plan.

Each agency's plan and subsequent reports shall designate an appropriate official to coordinate implementation of the plan and preparation of progress reports required by this memorandum. The Assistant to the President for Domestic Policy and the Director of the OMB shall review agency plans and subsequent reports for consistency with the policies and directives of Executive Order 13175.

In addition, the Director of the OMB, in coordination with the Assistant to the President for Domestic Policy, shall submit to me, within 1 year from the date of this memorandum, a report on the implementation of Executive Order 13175 across the executive branch based on the review of agency plans and progress reports. Recommendations for improving the plans and making the tribal consultation process more effective, if any, should be included in this report.

The terms "Indian tribe," "tribal officials," and "policies that have tribal implications" as used in this memorandum are as defined in Executive Order 13175.

The Director of the OMB is hereby authorized and directed to publish this memorandum in the *Federal Register*.

This memorandum is not intended to, and does not, create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law or in equity by any party against the United States, its departments, agencies, or entities, its officers, employees, or agents, or any other person. Executive departments and agencies shall carry out the provisions of this memorandum to the extent permitted by law and consistent with their statutory and regulatory authorities and their enforcement mechanisms.

Such

THE WHITE HOUSE, Washington, November 5, 2009.

[FR Doc. E9–27142 Filed 11–6–09; 11:15 am] Billing code 3110–01–P

Federal Register

Vol. 65, No. 218

Thursday, November 9, 2000

Presidential Documents

Title 3—

Executive Order 13175 of November 6, 2000

The President

Consultation and Coordination With Indian Tribal Governments

By the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, and in order to establish regular and meaningful consultation and collaboration with tribal officials in the development of Federal policies that have tribal implications, to strengthen the United States government-to-government relationships with Indian tribes, and to reduce the imposition of unfunded mandates upon Indian tribes; it is hereby ordered as follows:

Section 1. *Definitions.* For purposes of this order:

- (a) "Policies that have tribal implications" refers to regulations, legislative comments or proposed legislation, and other policy statements or actions that have substantial direct effects on one or more Indian tribes, on the relationship between the Federal Government and Indian tribes, or on the distribution of power and responsibilities between the Federal Government and Indian tribes.
- (b) "Indian tribe" means an Indian or Alaska Native tribe, band, nation, pueblo, village, or community that the Secretary of the Interior acknowledges to exist as an Indian tribe pursuant to the Federally Recognized Indian Tribe List Act of 1994, 25 U.S.C. 479a.
- (c) "Agency" means any authority of the United States that is an "agency" under 44 U.S.C. 3502(1), other than those considered to be independent regulatory agencies, as defined in 44 U.S.C. 3502(5).
- (d) "Tribal officials" means elected or duly appointed officials of Indian tribal governments or authorized intertribal organizations.
- **Sec. 2.** Fundamental Principles. In formulating or implementing policies that have tribal implications, agencies shall be guided by the following fundamental principles:
- (a) The United States has a unique legal relationship with Indian tribal governments as set forth in the Constitution of the United States, treaties, statutes, Executive Orders, and court decisions. Since the formation of the Union, the United States has recognized Indian tribes as domestic dependent nations under its protection. The Federal Government has enacted numerous statutes and promulgated numerous regulations that establish and define a trust relationship with Indian tribes.
- (b) Our Nation, under the law of the United States, in accordance with treaties, statutes, Executive Orders, and judicial decisions, has recognized the right of Indian tribes to self-government. As domestic dependent nations, Indian tribes exercise inherent sovereign powers over their members and territory. The United States continues to work with Indian tribes on a government-to-government basis to address issues concerning Indian tribal self-government, tribal trust resources, and Indian tribal treaty and other rights.
- (c) The United States recognizes the right of Indian tribes to self-government and supports tribal sovereignty and self-determination.
- **Sec. 3.** *Policymaking Criteria.* In addition to adhering to the fundamental principles set forth in section 2, agencies shall adhere, to the extent permitted by law, to the following criteria when formulating and implementing policies that have tribal implications:

- (a) Agencies shall respect Indian tribal self-government and sovereignty, honor tribal treaty and other rights, and strive to meet the responsibilities that arise from the unique legal relationship between the Federal Government and Indian tribal governments.
- (b) With respect to Federal statutes and regulations administered by Indian tribal governments, the Federal Government shall grant Indian tribal governments the maximum administrative discretion possible.
- (c) When undertaking to formulate and implement policies that have tribal implications, agencies shall:
- (1) encourage Indian tribes to develop their own policies to achieve program objectives;
 - (2) where possible, defer to Indian tribes to establish standards; and
- (3) in determining whether to establish Federal standards, consult with tribal officials as to the need for Federal standards and any alternatives that would limit the scope of Federal standards or otherwise preserve the prerogatives and authority of Indian tribes.
- **Sec. 4.** Special Requirements for Legislative Proposals. Agencies shall not submit to the Congress legislation that would be inconsistent with the policy-making criteria in Section 3.
- **Sec. 5.** Consultation. (a) Each agency shall have an accountable process to ensure meaningful and timely input by tribal officials in the development of regulatory policies that have tribal implications. Within 30 days after the effective date of this order, the head of each agency shall designate an official with principal responsibility for the agency's implementation of this order. Within 60 days of the effective date of this order, the designated official shall submit to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) a description of the agency's consultation process.
- (b) To the extent practicable and permitted by law, no agency shall promulgate any regulation that has tribal implications, that imposes substantial direct compliance costs on Indian tribal governments, and that is not required by statute, unless:
- (1) funds necessary to pay the direct costs incurred by the Indian tribal government or the tribe in complying with the regulation are provided by the Federal Government; or
 - (2) the agency, prior to the formal promulgation of the regulation,
- (A) consulted with tribal officials early in the process of developing the proposed regulation;
- (B) in a separately identified portion of the preamble to the regulation as it is to be issued in the **Federal Register**, provides to the Director of OMB a tribal summary impact statement, which consists of a description of the extent of the agency's prior consultation with tribal officials, a summary of the nature of their concerns and the agency's position supporting the need to issue the regulation, and a statement of the extent to which the concerns of tribal officials have been met; and
- (C) makes available to the Director of OMB any written communications submitted to the agency by tribal officials.
- (c) To the extent practicable and permitted by law, no agency shall promulgate any regulation that has tribal implications and that preempts tribal law unless the agency, prior to the formal promulgation of the regulation,
- (1) consulted with tribal officials early in the process of developing the proposed regulation;
- (2) in a separately identified portion of the preamble to the regulation as it is to be issued in the **Federal Register**, provides to the Director of OMB a tribal summary impact statement, which consists of a description of the extent of the agency's prior consultation with tribal officials, a summary of the nature of their concerns and the agency's position supporting the

- need to issue the regulation, and a statement of the extent to which the concerns of tribal officials have been met; and
- (3) makes available to the Director of OMB any written communications submitted to the agency by tribal officials.
- (d) On issues relating to tribal self-government, tribal trust resources, or Indian tribal treaty and other rights, each agency should explore and, where appropriate, use consensual mechanisms for developing regulations, including negotiated rulemaking.
- Sec. 6. Increasing Flexibility for Indian Tribal Waivers.
- (a) Agencies shall review the processes under which Indian tribes apply for waivers of statutory and regulatory requirements and take appropriate steps to streamline those processes.
- (b) Each agency shall, to the extent practicable and permitted by law, consider any application by an Indian tribe for a waiver of statutory or regulatory requirements in connection with any program administered by the agency with a general view toward increasing opportunities for utilizing flexible policy approaches at the Indian tribal level in cases in which the proposed waiver is consistent with the applicable Federal policy objectives and is otherwise appropriate.
- (c) Each agency shall, to the extent practicable and permitted by law, render a decision upon a complete application for a waiver within 120 days of receipt of such application by the agency, or as otherwise provided by law or regulation. If the application for waiver is not granted, the agency shall provide the applicant with timely written notice of the decision and the reasons therefor.
- (d) This section applies only to statutory or regulatory requirements that are discretionary and subject to waiver by the agency.

Sec. 7. Accountability.

- (a) In transmitting any draft final regulation that has tribal implications to OMB pursuant to Executive Order 12866 of September 30, 1993, each agency shall include a certification from the official designated to ensure compliance with this order stating that the requirements of this order have been met in a meaningful and timely manner.
- (b) In transmitting proposed legislation that has tribal implications to OMB, each agency shall include a certification from the official designated to ensure compliance with this order that all relevant requirements of this order have been met.
- (c) Within 180 days after the effective date of this order the Director of OMB and the Assistant to the President for Intergovernmental Affairs shall confer with tribal officials to ensure that this order is being properly and effectively implemented.
- **Sec. 8.** *Independent Agencies.* Independent regulatory agencies are encouraged to comply with the provisions of this order.
- **Sec. 9.** General Provisions. (a) This order shall supplement but not supersede the requirements contained in Executive Order 12866 (Regulatory Planning and Review), Executive Order 12988 (Civil Justice Reform), OMB Circular A–19, and the Executive Memorandum of April 29, 1994, on Government-to-Government Relations with Native American Tribal Governments.
- (b) This order shall complement the consultation and waiver provisions in sections 6 and 7 of Executive Order 13132 (Federalism).
- (c) Executive Order 13084 (Consultation and Coordination with Indian Tribal Governments) is revoked at the time this order takes effect.
 - (d) This order shall be effective 60 days after the date of this order.

Sec. 10. *Judicial Review.* This order is intended only to improve the internal management of the executive branch, and is not intended to create any right, benefit, or trust responsibility, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law by a party against the United States, its agencies, or any person.

William Temmen

THE WHITE HOUSE, November 6, 2000.

[FR Doc. 00–29003 Filed 11–8–00; 8:45 am] Billing code 3195–01–P