US Army Corps of Engineers
Sacramento District

City of Woodland

LOWER CACHE CREEK, YOLO COUNTY, CA
CITY OF WOODLAND AND VICINITY

DRAFT FEASIBILITY REPORT
FOR POTENTIAL
FLOOD DAMAGE REDUCTION PROJECT

Cache Creek Levee Failure, January 27, 1983, looking south towards Woodland.

MARCH 2003

LOWER CACHE CREEK, YOLO COUNTY, CA
CITY OF WOODLAND AND VICINITY

DRAFT FEASIBILITY REPORT
FOR POTENTIAL
FLOOD DAMAGE REDUCTION PROJECT

MARCH 2003

US Army Corps
of Engineers
Sacramento District

City of Woodland

LOWER CACHE CREEK, YOLO COUNTY, CA
CITY OF WOODLAND AND VICINITY

DRAFT FEASIBILITY REPORT
FOR POTENTIAL FLOOD DAMAGE
REDUCTION PROJECT

Contents

CONTENTS

	Page
Executive Summary	ES-1
Study Area	ES-1
Need for Action	ES-1
Significant Issues	ES-1
Flood Damage Reduction Measures and Preliminary Plans	ES-4
Evaluation of Alternative Plans Considered in Detail	ES-4
Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan	ES-4
Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan	ES-7
Major Conclusions and Findings	ES-9
Unresolved Issues	ES-10
Tentatively Recommended Plan	ES-11

Chapter 1 – Introduction

Purpose and Scope of Report	1-1
Need for the Proposed Project	1-2
Location of Study Area	1-2
Background	1-2
Study Authority	1-5
Related Studies and Reports	1-5
Corps of Engineers	1-5
Federal Emergency Management Agency	1-7
U.S. Department of Agriculture – Natural Resources Conservation Service	1-8
Bureau of Land Management	1-8
U.S. Geological Survey	1-8
State of California	1-9
Yolo County	1-9

Chapter 2 – Existing and Likely Future Without-Project Conditions

Existing Conditions	2-1
Physical Setting	2-1
Social and Economic Conditions	2-13
Environmental Resources	2-18
Without-Project Future Conditions	2-20
Physical Setting	2-20
Social and Economic Conditions	2-23
Environmental Resources	2-24

Chapter 3 – Problems and Opportunities

Problem Identification Process 3-1
Lower Cache Creek Flood Problems 3-1
Nondamaging Channel Capacities and Levee Failures 3-1
Frequency of Flooding 3-2
Flood Plains and Flood Damages 3-3
Lower Cache Creek Natural Resources Problems 3-6

Chapter 4 – Plan Formulation and Evaluation Process

Planning Objectives 4-1
Planning Constraints 4-2
Planning Evaluation Criteria 4-2
Completeness 4-2
Effectiveness 4-3
Efficiency 4-3
Acceptability 4-3
Period of Analysis 4-4
Hydrologic and Hydraulic Analyses 4-4
Initial Screening of Flood Damage Reduction Measures 4-4
Nonstructural 4-5
Structural 4-6
Findings 4-9
Preliminary Plans Considered 4-9
Channel Clearing 4-9
Raising Existing Levees and Constructing New Levees 4-11
Channelization and Constructing New Levee 4-11
Constructing Setback Levees and Raising Existing Levees 4-11
Constructing a Flood Barrier Levee 4-11

Chapter 5 – Evaluation of Preliminary Plans

Preliminary Evaluation 5-1
No-Action Plan 5-1
Channel Clearing, Preliminary Plan 5-1
General Description 5-1
Plan Accomplishments 5-2
Potential Environmental Effects 5-2
Raising Existing Levees and Constructing New Levees, Preliminary Plan 5-2
General Description 5-2
Plan Accomplishments 5-3
Potential Environmental Effects 5-3

Channelization and Constructing New Levees, Preliminary Plan 5-3
General Description 5-3
Plan Accomplishments..... 5-3
Potential Environmental Effects 5-4
Constructing Setback Levees and Raising Existing Levees, Preliminary Plan 5-4
General Description 5-4
Plan Accomplishments..... 5-4
Potential Environmental Impacts..... 5-5
Constructing a Flood Barrier, Preliminary Plan 5-5
General Description 5-5
Plan Accomplishments..... 5-5
Potential Environmental Impacts..... 5-6
Comparative Cost Estimates..... 5-6
Preliminary Evaluation 5-7
Completeness 5-7
Effectiveness 5-9
Efficiency..... 5-9
Acceptability 5-9
Summary and Selected Preliminary Plans 5-11

Chapter 6 – Evaluation and Comparison of Final Plans

Evaluation of No-Action Plan..... 6-1
Evaluation of the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier 6-3
Need for Refinement..... 6-3
Refinements Considered 6-3
Comparison Costs 6-4
Description of Refined LCCFB Plan 6-5
Physical Features 6-5
Accomplishments of Plans..... 6-15
Hydraulic Mitigation..... 6-15
Operation and Maintenance 6-16
Operation of the Pond Outlet Facilities 6-17
Environmental Effects and Mitigation..... 6-24
Costs..... 6-27
Evaluation of Setback Levee Plans..... 6-30
Description of Narrow Setback Levee Plan..... 6-30
Physical Features 6-30
Accomplishments of Plans..... 6-38
Hydraulic Mitigation..... 6-38
Operation and Maintenance 6-39
Environmental Effects and Mitigation..... 6-40
Costs..... 6-41
Description of Wide Setback Levee Plan 6-43
Physical Features 6-43
Accomplishments of Plans..... 6-45

Hydraulic Mitigation 6-45
Operation and Maintenance 6-46
Environmental Effects and Mitigation 6-46
Costs 6-48
Description of Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan 6-50
Physical Features 6-50
Accomplishments of Plans 6-53
Hydraulic Mitigation 6-53
Operation and Maintenance 6-54
Environmental Effects and Mitigation 6-54
Costs 6-56
Comparison of Plans 6-58
Benefits 6-58
Costs 6-58
Net Benefits 6-59
Potential Environmental Effects 6-64
Accomplishments of Plans 6-66
Tentatively Recommended Plan 6-67
Rationale for Selection of Recommended Plan 6-67

Chapter 7 – Public Involvement

Public Interest 7-1
Comments on the EIS/EIR 7-2
Responses to Frequently Asked Questions 7-2
Introduction 7-2
Extent of Flooding and Effects 7-2
Proposed Flood Control Structures 7-5
Environmental Issues 7-5
Real Estate and Mitigation 7-6
Plan Selection 7-8

Chapter 8 – Plan Implementation, Conclusions, and Recommendations

Implementation Requirements 8-1
Draft Report Review and Plan Selection 8-1
Final Report and Approval 8-1
Project Funding 8-1
Cost-Sharing Requirements 8-2
Cost Apportionment 8-2
General 8-2
Cost Sharing 8-4
Cost Estimate 8-5
Financial Analysis 8-5
Department of Water Resources 8-5

Project Cooperation Agreement 8-6
Estimated Project Schedule 8-6
Conclusions 8-7
Recommendations 8-7
Non-Federal Responsibilities 8-7

REFERENCES

TABLES

Tables Page

ES-1 Summary Comparison Between the No-Action, the LCCFB, and the MWSL Plans ES-13
ES-2 Summary of Environmental Effects and Mitigation – LCCFB Plan ES-16
ES-3 Summary of Environmental Effects and Mitigation – MWSL Plan ES-20
ES-4 Status of Compliance ES-24
3-1 Estimated Peak Flows for Cache Creek at Road 94B 3-3
4-1 Initial Screening of Nonstructural and Structural Measures 4-4
5-1 Comparative Cost Estimates of Preliminary Plans 5-7
5-2 Comparison of Ability of Flood Damage Reduction Plans to Meet Planning Criteria Preliminary Screening 5-10
6-1 Estimated Present-Worth Costs of Future Repairs of the Existing Cache Creek Levee System 6-2
6-2 Comparative Cost Estimates for Three Alternative Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plans 6-5
6-3A Total Project Cost Summary for the LCCFB Plan, 70,000 cfs Design Flow 6-28
6-3B Total Project Cost Summary for the LCCFB Plan, 78,000 cfs Design Flow 6-29
6-4 Total Project Cost Summary for the Narrow Setback Levee Plan, 78,000 cfs Design Flow 6-42
6-5 Total Project Cost Summary for the Wide Setback Levee Plan, 78,000 cfs Design Flow 6-49
6-6 Total Project Cost Summary for the Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan, 78,000 cfs Design Flow 6-57
6-7 Estimated Project Annual Damages and Benefits for Various Design Flows of the No-Action Plan, the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan, and the Setback Levee Plans 6-59
6-8 Estimated Project Investment and Annual Cost for Various Design Flows of the No-Action Plan, the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan, and the Setback Levee Plans 6-60
6-9 Project Costs and Benefits for Various Design Flows of the No-Action Plan, the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan, and the Setback Levee Plans 6-61

6-10 Comparison of Ability of the No-Action Plan, the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan, and the Setback Levee Plans to Meet the Objectives and Constraints of the Feasibility Study 6-68
8-1 First Costs and Annualized Cost LCCFB Plan, Tentatively Recommended Plan 8-3
8-2 Cost-Sharing Breakdown LCCFB Plan, Tentatively Recommended Plan 8-3
8-3 First Costs and Annualized Cost for the Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan 8-4
8-4 Cost-Sharing Breakdown for the Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan 8-4

FIGURES

Figures Page
ES-1 General and Vicinity Map Cache Creek Basin ES-2
ES-2 1 in 100 Chance Existing Conditions Flood Plain and Water Surface Elevation Contours ES-3
ES-3 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan Primary Features and 1 in 100 Chance Pre- and Post-Project Flood Plains ES-5
ES-4 Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan Primary Features and 1 in 100 Chance Pre- and Post-Project Flood Plains ES-8
1-1 General and Vicinity Map Cache Creek Basin 1-3
1-2 City of Woodland and Vicinity Map 1-4
2-1 Lower Cache Creek Geomorphic Reaches 2-4
2-2 Public Facilities in the FEMA 1 in 100 Chance Flood Plain 2-14
3-1 1 in 100 Chance Existing Conditions Flood Plain and Water-Surface Elevation Contours 3-4
3-2 Comparison of FEMA and Corps 1 in 100 Chance Existing Conditions Flood Plain 3-5
4-1 Typical Section, Channel Clearing 4-10
4-2 Typical Section, Raise Existing Levees and Construct New Levees 4-12
4-3 Typical Section, Channelization and Constructing New Levees 4-13
4-4 Typical Section, Constructing Setback Levees and Raising Existing Levees 4-14
4-5 Typical Section, New Levee 4-15
4-6 Typical Section, Constructing a Flood Barrier Levee 4-16
6-1 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan (With Inlet Weir) 6-6
6-2 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Levee Profile 6-7
6-3 Typical Section, Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier 6-9
6-4 Typical Section, New Levee and Inspection Trench 6-10
6-5 Typical Section, Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier with Slope Protection 6-12
6-6 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Pre- and Post-Project 1 in 100 Chance Flood Plain 6-14
6-7 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Maximum Extent of Ponding for Various Chance Flood Events 6-18

6-8 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Long-Term Floodwater Depths in Ponding Areas 6-19
6-9 Durations of Flooding for Various Chance Flood Events in the Ponding Area and in the Settling Basin for the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan 6-20
6-10 Stage Hydrographs for the 1 in 100 Chance Flood Event in the Ponding Area and in the Settling Basin for the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan 6-21
6-11 Narrow Setback Levee Plan 6-31
6-12 Typical Section, Setback Levee 6-32
6-13 Typical Section, New Levee and Inspection Trench 6-33
6-14 Typical Section, Raised Levee and Inspection Trench 6-34
6-15 Typical Section, Setback Levee with Slope Protection 6-35
6-16 Representative Modified Cross Sections for the Setback Levee Plans 6-36
6-17 Wide Setback Levee Plan 6-44
6-18 Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan 6-51
6-19 Annual Costs and Benefits for Narrow, Wide, and Modified Wide Setback Levee Plans and for the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan 6-62
6-20 Net Annual Benefits for the Narrow, Wide, and Modified Wide Setback Levee Plans and for the Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Plan 6-63

PLATES

1 Yolo County Zoning
2 City of Woodland Zoning
3 Land Use
4 Preliminary Plan, Channel Clearing
5 Preliminary Plan, Raising Existing Levees and Constructing New Levees
6 Preliminary Plan, Channelization and Constructing New Levees
7 Preliminary Plan, Constructing Setback Levees and Raising Existing Levees
8 Preliminary Plan, Constructing a Flood Barrier
9 Preliminary Plan, Constructing a Flood Barrier, 1 in 200 Chance Pre- and Post-Project Flood Plains
10 Preliminary Plan, Constructing a Flood Barrier, 1 in 200 Chance Pre- and Post-Project Flood Plains
11 Plan A, Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier (With Inlet Weir)
12 Plan B, Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier (Raise County Road 102 & Breach 4000 ft. of West Levee)
13 Plan C, Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier (Raise County Road 102 & Breach 9000 ft. of West Levee)
14 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Features at Inlet Weir
15 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Pre- and Post-Project Flood-Depth-Difference Plain
16 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier 1 in 200 Chance Pre- and Post-Project Flood Plain Depth-Duration Curves

17 Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier Pre- and Post-Project 1 in 100 Chance Flood Plain
18 Narrow Setback Levee Plan
19 Wide Setback Levee Plan
20 Modified Wide Setback Levee Plan
21 Section A, Setback Levee Alignments with Approximate Elderberry Locations

APPENDIXES

A Basis for Design for Evaluation of Selected Alternatives
B Geotechnical Risk-Based Analysis
C Hydrology
D Hydraulic Analysis
E Environmental Site Assessment
F Real Estate Plan
G Economics
H (Not Used)
I Qualitative Geomorphologic and Channel Stability Assessment of Lower Cache Creek
J (Not Used)
K Cost Estimates
L Evaluation of Potential Flooding from Cache Creek

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ADT	Average Daily Traffic Volumes
AQMD	Air Quality Management District
B/C	Benefit/Cost
BFE	Base Flood Elevation
Board	Reclamation Board of the State of California
CalTrans	California Department of Transportation
CAR	Coordination Act Report
CCRMP	Cache Creek Resources Management Plan
CCSB	Cache Creek Settling Basin
CEQA	California Environmental Quality Act
CFR	Code Federal Regulation
cfs	Cubic Feet per Second
CNRFC	California Nevada River Forecast Center
Corps	U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
CR	County Road
CRMP	Coordinated Resource Management Plan
DFG	Department of Fish and Game (California)
DWR	Department of Water Resources (California)
EDR	Environmental Data Resources, Inc.
EIR	environmental impact report
EIS	environmental impact statement
EPA	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
FEMA	Federal Emergency Management Agency
FIRM	Flood Insurance Rate Map
FIS	Flood Insurance Study
FS	Feasibility Study
USFWS	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
HTRW	Hazardous, Toxic, Radiological Waste
LCCFB	Lower Cache Creek Flood Barrier
LPP	Locally Preferred Plans
msl	Mean Sea Level
MWSL	Modified Wide Setback Levee
NAVD88	North America Vertical Datum, 1988
NAWQA	National Water-Quality Assessment
NED	National Economic Development
NEPA	National Environmental Policy Act
NFIP	National Flood Insurance Program
NHPA	National Historic Preservation Act
NMFS	U.S. National Marine Fisheries Service
NOI	Notice of Intent
NOP	Notification of Preparation
NRHP	National Register of Historic Places
NSL	Narrow Setback Levee

NRCS	USDA Natural Resources Conservation Service
NWS	National Weather Service
OCMP	Off-Channel Mining Plan
OMRR&R	Operation, Maintenance, Repair, Rehabilitation, and Replacement
O&M	Operations and Maintenance
PCB	Polychloride Biphenyls
PED	preconstruction engineering and design
PFP	Probable Failure Point
PM_{10}	Suspended Particulates
PNP	Probable Nonfailure Point
RWQCB	Regional Water Quality Control Board
SHPO	California Sate Historic Preservation Office
SRA	Shaded Riverine Aquatic
SRFCP	Sacramento River Flood Control Project
SWRCB	State Water Resources Control Board
YSAQMD	Yolo-Solano Air Quality Management District
SH	State Highway
SHPO	California State Historic Preservation Office
TMDL	Total Maximum Daily Load
UPNCRR	Union Pacific Northern California Railroad
USGS	U.S. Geological Survey
WSL	Wide Setback Levee